

Monuments and Street Names: Conflicts about the Traces of Enslavers and Defenders of Slavery in French Cities¹

Ulrike Schmieder

ABSTRACTS

Dieser Beitrag diskutiert die Auswirkungen der globalen Statuenstürze des Jahres 2020 auf Frankreich, wo, mit Hinblick auf das Erste Kolonialreich und koloniale Sklaverei, vor allem die Erinnerungsorte für Minister Colbert in Frage gestellt wurden, wegen seiner Rolle bei der Erstellung des *Code Noir*, des Gesetzbuches zur Sklaverei. Im Jahr 2021 spitzten sich die „Kriege der Erinnerungen“ angesichts der Koinzidenz des 200. Todestages von Napoleon Bonaparte und des 20. Jahrestages des Gesetzes Taubira zu. Präsident Macron stellte sich in diesem Konflikt auf die Seite der nationalistischen Rechten, er glorifizierte den für die Wiederversklavung verantwortlichen Ersten Konsul und beging den Nationalen Gedenktag an den Sklavenhandel, die Sklaverei und ihre Abolitionen mit Schweigen. Die gegenwärtigen Kontroversen um das Gedenken an die Versklavung werden im breiteren Kontext der französischen Erinnerungspolitik seit den späten 1980er Jahren, der Debatte um die Straßen, die in den Hafenstädten und Paris nach Versklavern benannt wurden, und die Errichtung neuer Gedenkkorte, an denen die Gedenkveranstaltungen zur Sklaverei zelebriert werden, dargestellt.

This article discusses the repercussions of the global statue toppling in 2020 in France where, with respect to the First Colonial Empire and colonial slavery, particularly the sites of memory of Minister Colbert were contested because of his role in editing the *Code Noir*, the French code of law on slavery. In 2021, the “wars on memory” grew more acute because of the coincidence of the bicentenary of the death of Napoleon Bonaparte and the 20th anniversary of the law Tau-

1 This article is based on the research project *Memories of Atlantic Slavery* funded by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG; German Research Foundation, reference: SCHM 1050/5-1).

bira. President Macron sided in this conflict with the nationalist right, glorifying the re-enslaving First Consul and remaining silent at the National Day of Remembrance of the Slave Trade, Slavery, and its Abolitions. The current controversies about the remembrance of enslavement are presented in the broader context of the development of French politics of memory on the slavery past since the late 1980s, the debate about streets named after enslavers in the port towns and Paris, and the establishment of new sites of memory where the commemorations of slavery are celebrated.

1. Introduction

In France, it might be that the coincidence of the 20th anniversary of the law Taubira with the bicentenary of the death of Napoleon Bonaparte in 2021 which brought to light abysmal conflicts in the French society about the remembrance of slavery and its legacies will have longer lasting effects than the repercussions of the murder of George Floyd and the Black Lives Matter in 2020. What happened on both occasions will be resumed later in this article.

Historiography about the politics of memory with respect to enslavement in hexagonal France start often with the silent march of Antilleans on 23 May 1998 protesting against the official narrative around the 150 anniversary of the second abolition of slavery in the French Antilles in 1848. The slogan “*nous sommes tous nés en 1848*” focused on honouring white abolitionists and the liberating French Republic, the nation which invented the human rights. In this narrative many things were missing: the societies of pre-colonial Africa, the liberation wars of the enslaved, the re-establishment of slavery by Napoleon Bonaparte, the indemnification of the perpetrators instead of the victims, post-slavery colonial forced labour, racialized socio-economic inequality in the Overseas Departments till today, racism, especially afro-phobia as legacy of slavery. The aftermath of 1998 led to the promulgation of the law Taubira of 2001 which condemned enslavement as crime against humanity. The paragraph about reparations, the principal claim of Antilleans, had been, however, effaced.

A closer look shows that not only in the Overseas Departments where pioneer research on slavery had been done, a counter-narrative about slavery and self-liberation, demands for commemoration and compensation had existed since the 1960s, but also in mainland France the debates had begun earlier. In Nantes, the debate started with the rejection of a conservative mayor to finance an exhibition referring to the tricentenary of the *Code Noir* (1685–1985). The association *Anneaux de la Mémoire* organized a big exhibition about the town's involvement in Atlantic slavery from 1992–1994 on occasion of the 500 anniversary of the “discovering” of the Americas. From 1987 Antilleans in Nantes had remembered their enslaved ancestors with a floral offering at the river in direction to the Atlantic Ocean, graveyard of so many Africans who died on the middle passage. The

Musée du Nouveau Monde in La Rochelle had displayed some vitrines about enslavement on the Antilles since the 1980s².

The story of the remembrance of slavery till 2021 cannot be narrated in one article.³ The most important debates and conflicts after the law Taubira referred to a series of issues:

– The teaching of slavery in schools, required by the law, which saw advances and setbacks, for instance the clash with the law *Repatriés* (2005) initiated by President Sarkozy. A paragraph, later effaced, ordered teachers to praise the achievements of French colonialism.⁴ Education of slavery remained in the curricula after its introduction, but still has big deficits, for instance with respect to the resistance of the enslaved, and the long-term consequences of slavery.⁵

– The establishment of commemorative days. The compromise to take 10th of May as (voting day of the law Taubira) against the proposal of 4th of February (proclamation of the First Abolition in 1794), 27th of April (decree about the Second Abolition in 1848), 23rd of August (start of the Haitian revolution, International Day for the Remembrance of the Slave Trade and its Abolition) and 23rd of May (silent march of Antilleans in 1998), was never accepted by the NGO *Comité March 98* (CM98). Finally, a second commemorative day, the 23 May, National Memorial Day for the Victims of Colonial Slavery, was introduced,⁶ being celebrated only in the Île de France.

– The institutionalization of the commemoration, leading to the foundation of the *Comité pour la Mémoire de l'Esclavage* in 2004 (led in the beginning by Marysé Condé, from 2008 onwards by Françoise Vergès), *Comité pour la Mémoire et l'Histoire de l'Esclavage*, 2009–2012 with President Françoise Vergès, *Comité National de Mémoire et de l'Histoire de l'Esclavage* 2013–2016 presided by Myriam Cottias, followed from 2016 to 2019 by Frédéric Régent till the inauguration of *Fondation pour la Mémoire de l'Esclavage* (FME) on 5 November 2019, with Jean-Marc Ayrault, former Mayor of Nantes and Prime Minister (2012–2014), as President.⁷

– The establishment of new sites of memory, first of all monuments. The Antilleans of Nantes had to fight 14 years (from 1998 to 2012) for getting the promised *Mémorial de l'Abolition de l'Esclavage*. Today, the Antilleans remember their ancestors there, and the

2 R. Hourcade, Renaud, *Les ports négriers face à leur histoire: politique de la mémoire à Nantes, Bordeaux et Liverpool*, Paris 2014, pp. 186–190, 196–209. M. Augeron, *La mémoire de la traite des Noirs, de l'esclavage et de leurs abolitions à La Rochelle: les initiatives municipales (1979–2015)*, in: *Philanthrope*, 7 (2018), pp. 73–97. Interview with Octave Cestor, founder of the NGO *Mémoire d'Outre-Mer*, and Martine Thiane, President of the NGO AAGLA, 25.10.2019.

3 N. Frith/K. Hodgson (eds.) *At the Limits of Memory: Legacies of Slavery in the Francophone World*, Liverpool 2015. J. Michel, *Devenir descendant d'esclave. Enquête sur les régimes mémoriels*, Rennes 2015. A. Gueye/J. Michel (eds.), *A Stain on our Past. Slavery and Memory*, Trenton 2018.

4 C. Coquery-Vidrovitch, *Enjeux politiques de l'histoire coloniale*, Paris 2009, pp. 110–132.

5 *L'esclavage dans les manuels et les programmes scolaires: 7 propositions*, *Les Notes de la FME*, 1 (2020). M.-A. De Suremaine/E. Mesnard, Introduction, in: M.-A. De Suremaine/E. Mesnard (eds.), *Enseigner les traites, les esclavages, les abolitions & leurs héritages*, Paris 2021, pp. 25–31.

6 Michel, *Devenir descendant d'esclave*, pp. 179–190. Interviews with historians Marcel Dorigny, member of the *Comité pour la Mémoire de l'esclavage*, on 8 May 2018, and Myriam Cottias, 18 May 2018.

7 To see organizations and members: CNMHE: <http://www.cnmhe.fr/spip.php?rubrique1>, FME, *Notre gouvernance*, in: <https://memoire-esclavage.org/notre-gouvernance> (accessed 17.8.2021).

municipal commemorative event on 10 May takes place on site.⁸ Bordeaux established in 2006 a pretend-to-remember site, an untraceable plaque at the Quays. In 2019, the statue of the African enslaved and later freed woman Modeste Testas (1765–1870), born Al Pouessi, deported by enslavers from Bordeaux to Saint-Domingue, remembered by their descendants till the sixth generation, was inaugurated there. La Rochelle presents the statue of Toussaint L'Ouverture in the courtyard of the *Musée du Nouveau Monde*, and plaques at the sea promenade remember the trade in enslaved Africans and the life of Toussaint Louverture. The Parisian Banlieue was precursor of the erection of monuments for the enslaved (*Solitude* in Bagneux, *La Gardienne de la Vie* in Sarcelles, small monuments with the names of enslaved ancestors established by the CM98). In 2007, the small monument *Le cri, l'écrit* in the *Jardin du Luxembourg* was inaugurated where the national commemorative ceremony on 10 May takes place.⁹ In 2021, a big memorial for the victims of slavery should be inaugurated in the *Jardin des Tuileries*, where in the *Théâtre des Tuileries* the Jacobin Convention had decided to abolish slavery in 1794. But its opening was delayed due of conflicts between President Macron and the FME, the FME, the Jury and the CM98 over the procedure of selection of oeuvres. The CM98 protested against the designs which the selected artist had delivered, because none of them corresponds the idea of glass murals with all the names of the freedmen of 1848 engraved.¹⁰ This concept is also controversial because the names were octroyed by colonial officers, not chosen by the emancipated. In Paris one has to distinguish between sites for which national institutions are responsible, and those owned by the city. Mayors Bernard Delanoë and Anne Hidalgo established sites of memory for the once-enslaved.¹¹ – Museums or Galleries in Museums. The most important museums which include galleries dedicated to enslavement are the *Musée d'Histoire* in Nantes, the *Musée d'Aquitaine* in Bordeaux and the *Musée du Nouveau Monde* in La Rochelle, the memorial sites of the *Route des Abolitions de l'Esclavage* in East France, particularly the *Maison de la Négritude*

8 E. Chérel/G. Brindis Álvarez, *Lé Mémorial de l'abolition de l'esclavage de Nantes. Enjeux et controverses* (1998–2012), Nantes 2012. Interview with Octave Cestor, Martine Thiane, 25.10.2019.

9 Images: M. Dorigny, *Arts & Lettres contre l'esclavage*, Paris 2018, nos. 77, 153, 171, 186. F. Hubert, *Traite, esclavage et enjeux patrimoniaux dans la Région Nouvelle-Aquitaine*, in: C. Le Mao et al., *Bordeaux, La Rochelle, Rochefort, Bayonne, Mémoire Noire. Histoire de l'Esclavage*, Abbéville 2020, pp. 223–244. B. Martinetti, *La traite négrière à La Rochelle*, La Crèche 2017, pp. 42–45. <http://cm98.fr/portfolio-items/ceremonies-et-hommages-national-aux-victimes-de-l-esclavage-colonial-du-23-mai-2020/> (accessed 17.8.2021).

10 Les notes de la FME, 10 (2021), correspondence between President Macron and Jean-Marc Ayrault, March 2021. R. Azimi, *A Paris, le projet de mémorial des victimes de l'esclavage aux Tuileries dans l'impasse*, in: *Le Monde*, 22.2.2021, https://www.lemonde.fr/afrique/article/2021/02/22/a-paris-le-memorial-des-victimes-de-l-esclavage-aux-tuileries-dans-l-impasse_6070824_3212.html (accessed 20.8.2021).

11 The monument "Fers" (2009), the memorial gardens for *Solitude* (2020) and *Toussaint Louverture* (2021). M. Dorigny/M.-J. Zins (eds.), *Les traites négrières coloniales. Histoire d'un crime*, Paris 2009, pp. 255–257. Anne Hidalgo a inauguré un jardin en hommage à une héroïne de la résistance des esclaves, *Solitude*, in: *Le Figaro*, 26.9.2020, <https://www.lefigaro.fr/flash-actu/anne-hidalgo-a-inaugure-un-jardin-en-hommage-a-une-heroine-de-la-resistance-des-esclaves-solitude-20200926>, A. J. Vidal, *Le jardin Toussaint Louverture est inauguré à Paris*: in: *karibinfo.com*, 10.5.2021, <https://www.karibinfo.com/index.php/2021/05/10/le-jardin-toussaint-louverture-est-inaugure-a-paris> (accessed 27.8.2021).

et des Droits de l'Homme in Champagney.¹² For President Macron the *Mémorial ACTe* in Guadeloupe is the national centre of remembrance of slavery, but this remote place encloses the memories of slavery on the Caribbean islands, far away from French elite, but also from the Antillean diaspora which lives in the Île de France. Scholars, memorial associations, and the President of the FME demand a national museum of slavery in Paris.¹³ The restitution of objects in museums acquired under colonial rule is a related topic. According to a law voted in December 2020 France gives back 26 oeuvres of the treasure of Béhanzin to Benin, and the sabre d'El Hadj Omar Tall to Senegal – in view of 45.000 unjustly acquired objects in the Musée du Quay Branly, alone.¹⁴ – Financial reparations for slavery. They are particularly advocated by Parisian NGOs of the African diaspora, p. e. *Collectif des Filles et Fils d'Africains Déportés* (COFFAD),¹⁵ an association trying to unite Black French people from Africa and the Caribbean (*Conseil Représentatif des Associations Noires*, CRAN), the *Association des Amis du Général Dumas*, the umbrella organization *Comité d'Organisation du 10 Mai* (C-O10Mai), and activists in the Overseas Departments.¹⁶ The CM98 and other Antillean associations in Paris (*Le Collectif des Antillais, Guyanais, Réunionnais et Mahorais* COLLECTIFDOM, *Association des descendants d'esclaves noirs et de leurs amis*, ADEN), various Antillean NGOs and the African association *Maison de l'Afrique* in Nantes, the *Comités Devoir Mémoire* (CDM) abstain from the demand of payments, but not from reparation through recognition and commemoration of the enslavement past.¹⁷

12 Hourcade, Les ports négriers, pp. 409–460. K. Gualdé, Musée versus mémorial?, in: *Philanthrope*, 7 (2018), pp. 99–109. M. Augeron, La mémoire de la traite. N. Barbe, J.-C. Sevin, Les ancêtres, l'esclavage, la Négritude et l'art africain dans une Maison: politique du patrimoine et altérité, in: *Alterstice*, 5 (2015) 2, pp. 63–78. U. Schmieder, Lieux de mémoire et lieux d'oubli de la traite des Africains et l'esclavage: une comparaison entre les villes portuaires espagnoles et françaises, in M. Augeron (ed.), *Des patrimoines transatlantiques en miroir. Mémoires du premier empire colonial français*, Geste éditions, 2021 (in print).

13 The following interviewees spoke out in favour of a National Museum of Slavery (and Colonialism) in Paris: Jean-Marc Ayrault (28.11.2019), Cathérine Coquéry-Vidrovitch, expert in African history (14.5.2018), Myriam Cottias, in conversations in 2018 and 2021, Florence Alexis, Chargée des missions, CNHME 2014–2017 (28. 5.2018), Emmanuel Gordien (CM98, 25.5.2018), Françoise Vergès (26.5.2018), Krystel Gualdé (academic director of the museum in Nantes, 17.10.2019), Octave Cestor, Martine Thiane (25.10.2019), Nicolà Chéri-Zecoté (Métisse à Nantes (31.10.2019). Barbara Chiron, Yvon Chotard (Anneaux de la Mémoire, 22.10.2019), Dieudonné Buitron, Jean Luc Chery (Fraternité Coque Nomade, 28.10.2019) opted for the establishment of such a museum in Nantes.

14 Loi du 24 décembre 2020 relative à la restitution de biens culturels à la République du Bénin et à la République du Sénégal, <https://www.vie-publique.fr/loi/275500-loi-sur-la-restitution-de-biens-culturels-au-benin-et-du-senegal> F. Sarr/B. Savoy, Rapport sur la restitution du patrimoine culturel africain. Vers une nouvelle éthique relationnelle, Novembre 2018, pp. 40–41. http://restitutionreport2018.com/sarr_savoy_fr.pdf (accessed 27.8.2021).

15 This organization of the African diaspora has an antisemitic bias. See the comment of Sylviane Larcher, political scientist with Martinican roots, against "victim competition" between enslaved Africans and Jews, antisemitic tendencies of memorial activists: S. Larcher, Les errances de la mémoire de l'esclavage colonial et la démocratie française aujourd'hui, in: *Cités* (2006), 25, pp. 153–163.

16 *Comité International des Peuples Noirs* (CIPN), *Mouvement International pour les Réparations* with branches in Martinique, Guadeloupe, and Guyana, *Comité National pour les Réparations* (CNR) in Martinique, *Fos pou Konstwui Nasion Gwadeloup!* (FKNGI), *Kolèktif Doubout Pou Gwadeloup* in Guadeloupe.

17 A. Gueye, The Past is a Contentious Field, The Memory of the Atlantic Slave Trade in the Black French Organizational Dynamic, in: Gueye/Michel, A Stain on our Past, pp. 91–114. Michel, Devenir descendant d'esclave, pp. 190–202. U. Schmieder, Memories of Slavery in France and its French Afro-Antillean Diaspora: Overview of Sites of Memory and their Entanglements with British and US-American Images of Slavery and Debates on Repara-

Plummeting memorials of enslavers and political promoters and defenders of slavery *has not been an issue* of the conflicts about the remembrance of slavery till 2020. With respect to the material vestiges of slavery, Nantes was the first town which developed an urban trail between museum and memorial with 11 plaques explaining related historical sites.¹⁸ The *Anneaux de la Mémoire* have produced flyers and booklets on the traces of enslavers.¹⁹ Bordeaux has recently developed a memorial trail with detailed explanations on a website.²⁰ The association *Mémoires & Partages* organizes guided tours following the related historical sites connected with enslavers and enslaved first in Bordeaux, now available also for La Rochelle, Le Havre and Bayonne.²¹ The city of La Rochelle had published the leaflet “Mémoires rochelaises du commerce triangulaire” with indication of the residences of enslavers, the sugar refineries, the bourse, and votive paintings donated by enslavers in the Cathedral. Guided tours are offered by the association *Memoria*.²² Whereas the old statues had not been an important topic in the debate about the cultural heritage of slavery, street names had been.

2. The Conflict about Street Names and its Outcome till Today

In the port towns, the fight for changing or commenting street names honouring enslavers has been connected with one charismatic personality, Karfa Diallo, a French citizen with Senegalese roots, today President of the NGO *Mémoires & Partages* which he also represents in the *Conseil d'orientation* of the FME. He had also fought with NGO *DiversCités* and the *Fondation européenne du Mémorial de la Traite des Noirs* for a big memorial remembering the commerce in enslaved Africans in Bordeaux, a plan which was rejected by the town which opted for the presentation of the slavery past in the *Musée d'Aquitaine*.²³

On occasion of the murder of George Floyd and the following iconoclastic movement, Karfa Diallo explained in an interview with *france inter* the current attitude of his asso-

tions, in: O. Kaltmeier et al. (eds.), *Cherishing the Past, Envisioning the Future: Entangled Practices of Heritage and Utopia in the Americas*, Trier 2021, pp. 31–57, esp. pp. 40–42. For the associations in Nantes and the CM98 see note 13. For Martinique, see article in this journal.

18 Le Mémorial dans la ville, un parcours urbain, in: http://memorial.nantes.fr/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Panneaux_parcours_dans_la_ville.pdf (accessed 17.8.2021).

19 Anneaux de la Mémoire (J. Breteau), *Sur les traces de Nantes port négrier. Un itinéraire-témoin à travers l'architecture nantaise*, Nantes. Anneaux de la Mémoire (J. Breteau, J. P. Cohen, M. Touzé, S. Chetenneau), Barbechat, Nantes, Paimboeuf: sur les traces de la traite négrière, Nantes 2008.

20 Mémoire de l'esclavage et de la traite négrière: <https://www.memoire-esclavage-bordeaux.fr/parcours-memorial> (accessed 17.9.2021).

21 Mémoires & Partages, Les visites guidées, in: <http://memoiresetpartages.com/visite-guidee/> (accessed 17.8.2021).

22 https://www.larochelle.fr/fileadmin/mediatheque/Rub_ACTUALITES/MEMOIRE_ESCLAVAGE/parcours_-traite_negriere_01.pdf. Le Mois des Mémoires et des Combats pour la Liberté - 20 ans de la Loi Taubira du 27 avril au 12 juin 2021 à La Rochelle, in: <https://memoire-esclavage.org/mois-des-memoires-et-des-combats-pour-la-liberte-20-ans-de-la-loi-taubira-la-rochelle> (accessed 17.8.2021).

23 Bonin, *La Mémoire de la traite négrière*, pp. 256–258. F. Hubert, *Le musée au cœur du conflit entre le mémoire et l'histoire. Le débat autour des salles sur l'esclavage au musée d'Aquitaine*, in: *Philanthrope*, 7 (2018), pp. 114–121, pp. 228, 231–233. Hourcade, *Les ports négriers*, pp. 229–283, 448–459.

ciation with respect to streets named after enslavers: They would not demand the renaming of all streets related to enslavers, but that at least one street in every town should be re-baptized and the street names and their historical context should be explained.²⁴

2.1. Bordeaux

In the home town of Karfa Diallo, Bordeaux, the struggle of more than twenty years (begun in 1998 with the march students of African and Antillean descent, initiated the organization *Africapac*, and the foundation of *DiversCités* in 1998, both under his leadership),²⁵ led to the inauguration of commemorative plaques which explain the names of the six streets (named after the merchants or captains in the trade of enslaved Africans, Jacques-Barthélémy Gramont, Pierre Desse, David Gradis, Etienne Feger-Latour, Jean-Baptiste Mareilhac, Bernard Journu-Auber) at the beginning of 2020. This is part of the mentioned urban trail on the traces of enslavement which came into being as part 10-Points-Plan of new politics of memory with respect to slavery, accepted in 2018 and realized in 2019 and 2020.²⁶ The new transparency vis-a-vis the historical role of Bordeaux in trafficking African captives has its limits. As in Nantes the numerous still existing buildings which had been residences of enslavers (Hôtels Saige, Couturier, Gradis, Nairac, Fonfrède, Journu, Camescasse, Latour-Féger²⁷) are not labelled as historical sites connected to the enslavement past, obviously in order not to disturb the current owners.

The town started the establishment of the plaques with the *Rue Gradis* and also some media announced the new memorial sites pointing first to the Jewish merchant David Gradis,²⁸ insinuating that the trade in enslaved Africans was a Jewish business. The family Gradis deported enslaved Africans, but the clear majority of enslavers were Protestants, followed with distance by Catholics.²⁹ The website is concerned with street names, not former residences of enslavers, and as a consequence those being presented online are not the biggest traders in captives. The most important merchants are named in an historical overview, where once more the family Gradis appears first as if it had been the leading enslaver family: “Les maisons Gradis, Nairac, Couturier, Laffon de Ladebat sont les plus

24 B. Dugué/V. Emmanuele, La France a débaptisé des noms de collabos, pourquoi pas celles qui portent des noms de négriers?, in: france inter, 11.6.2020. <https://www.franceinter.fr/la-france-a-debaptise-les-rues-portant-le-nom-de-collabos-pourquoi-pas-celles-des-negriers> (accessed 1.8.2021). Statue toppling is mentioned in this article only with reference to other countries.

25 Hourcade, Les ports négriers, pp. 126–128.

26 Hubert, Traite, esclavage et enjeux patrimoniaux, pp. 239–244.

27 D. Pétrissans-Cavaillès, Sur les traces de la traite des noirs à Bordeaux, Paris 2004, pp. 45–49, 52–60.

28 Y. López, Vingt années de patrimonialisation de l’esclavage et de la traite des Noirs à Bordeaux, enjeux et réalisations, lecture at conference “Des patrimoines transatlantiques en miroir. Mémoires du premier empire colonial français”, Université de La Rochelle, 14/15.11.2019. E. Provenzano, Bordeaux: Six nouvelles plaques dans les rues pour “un travail de juste mémoire” sur son passé négrier, in: 20 minutes, 2.12.2019, <https://www.20minutes.fr/bordeaux/2665375-20191202-bordeaux-six-nouvelles-plaques-rues-travail-juste-memoire-passe-negrier> (accessed 18.8.2021).

29 E. Saugera, Bordeaux port négrier, chronologie, économie, idéologie, XVIIe–XIXe siècles, Paris 2002 (2nd edn), pp. 232–233.

importantes [armateurs bordelaises].”³⁰ The ranking according to the number of expeditions in the commerce of human beings would be: family Nairac, protestant merchants responsible for 25 deportation voyages from Bordeaux, 15 voyages were organized by Laffon de Ladébat, 14 by Couturier, 11 each by Marchais and Senat, 10 each by Gradis and Dommenget.³¹

The municipal website “Mémoire de l’Esclavage et la Traite négrière” includes also a rubric “associés à tort”, that means street names associated falsely with the “négriers”,³² the problematic French notion for enslavers. The webpage reveals that one maintains the separation between trade (condemned) and slavery (accepted), and does not know the concept of “slave-based activities” in European economies which historians use to measure the economic influence of Atlantic slavery on the development of capitalism.³³ Interestingly, the ancestors of two descendants of enslavers, Axelle Balguerrie and Pierre de Bethmann, who decided to acknowledge the enslavers past of their family and participate in the commemorative ceremonies on 10 May,³⁴ are exculpated by the municipal website. The involvement of Johann Jakob/Jean-Jacques Bethmann (after whose grandson Alexandre de Bethmann, mayor of Bordeaux, a street is named) in the slave trade could have happened, but was not proven. He traded wine, sugar, coffee and indigo. The Bethmann family had supported the Moravians, “les premiers militants abolitionnistes – avant même la création en 1788 de la Société des amis des Noirs”. (This is false: The Moravians owned enslaved Africans and staunchly defended slavery.³⁵) Referring to the *Cours Balguerrie-Stuttenberg* it is explained that it honours Pierre Balguerrie-Stuttenberg for his participation in infrastructure works, the foundation of the savings bank and *Banque de Bordeaux*. His father Jean Balguerrie had traded with plantations on Saint-Domingue using slaves, and married the daughter of a merchant from this island. Pierre Balguerrie had been involved in slavery, but not in the “système négrier” (although he wanted to arm a slave trade ship, but was hindered by the prohibition of this commerce in 1815), he had traded with plantations products from Martinique and Guadeloupe. He was related by his great-grandfather with the captain and merchant of the “traite des noirs”, Jean-Etienne Balguerrie junior.³⁶ The functionaries of Bordeaux admit the involve-

30 Histoire, L’esclavage et les traites, in: Mémoire de l’esclavage et de la traite négrière, <https://www.memoire-esclavage-bordeaux.fr/histoire> (accessed 18.8.2021).

31 Saugera, Bordeaux port négrier, pp. 229–231.

32 <https://www.memoire-esclavage-bordeaux.fr/portraits> (accessed 19.8.2021).

33 T. Combrink/M. van Rossum, Introduction: the Impact of Slavery on Europe – Reopening a Debate, in: T. Combrink/M. van Rossum (eds.), *Europe and Slavery: Revisiting the Impact of Slave-Based Activities on European Economies, 1500–1850*, in: *Slavery & Abolition*, 42 (2021) 1, pp. 1–14.

34 Bonin, La mémoire, p. 269. Bordeaux: esclavage, le long travail des mémoires, Retour sur l’histoire à Bordeaux et sur les traces que la traite des esclaves a laissées, avec Karfa Diallo, Axelle Balguerrie et Pierre de Bethmann, in: *Sud-Ouest*, 5.5.2016, <https://www.sudouest.fr/2016/05/04/esclavage-le-long-travail-des-memoiresqui-sont-ils-2350129-2780.php> (accessed 19.8.2021).

35 C. Füllberg-Stolberg, *The Moravian Mission and the Emancipation of Slaves in the Caribbean*, in: U. Schmieder/K. Füllberg-Stolberg/M. Zeuske (eds.), *The End of Slavery in Africa and the Americas: A Comparative Approach*, Berlin 2011, pp. 81–102. Saugera, *Bordeaux port négrier*, p. 233, emphasizes that Bethmann financed diverse expeditions in the trade with enslaved Africans.

36 Saugera, *Bordeaux port négrier*, p. 233. The Swiss company Baux, Balguerrie & Cie. armed eight ships for the com-

ment of the town's merchants in Atlantic slavery, but belittle its extent and the impact in the nineteenth century.

2.2. La Rochelle

The discussion about the street names in La Rochelle was pushed by the campaign of the association *DiversCités* and Karfa Diallo in 2009 „Débaptiser les rues de négriers“. Mayor Maxime Bono argued that the streets had been baptized after descendants of enslavers not the traffickers themselves.³⁷ The local memorial association *Memoria* confirmed on 2 July 2020, that she was not in favour of changing street names, but to use them for pedagogy about the slavery.³⁸

Under Mayor François Fountaine seven sites/streets were furnished with commemorative plaques in the month of remembrance 2021, with the explicit approval of *Memoria*. Two examples shall explain the idea and scope of this pace of politics of memory. One tablet asserts at the “Rue Daniel Garesché (1739–1811)”, that Daniel Garesché, owner of the ship *Comte de Forcalquier*, the biggest ship in trafficking enslaved persons of La Rochelle, was elected mayor in 1791, but had to retreat in 1792, because „les révoltes“ of Saint-Domingue had ruined him. At the “Rue Louis Benjamin Fleuriau (1761–1852)” is explicated that the deputy, savant, natural scientist and philanthropist Louis-Benjamin Fleuriau had not participated in the „traite négrière“, but his ancestors.

On one hand, this initiative will distribute the knowledge about the involvement of this second port of the commerce with enslaved Africans, particularly as the related website offers more information, for instance about Aimé-Benjamin Fleuriau. His uncle Paul had exploited 150 slaves. A.B. Fleuriau had been 27 years in Saint-Domingue and acquired land in Cud-de-Sac, houses and a commercial centre in Port-au-Prince. Daniel Garesché he had owned eight ships for the deportation of Africans and the *Comte de Forcalquier* had space for 778 captives.³⁹

On the other hand, also here, the explanations have a narrow focus. The fact, that Louis Benjamin Fleuriau had time and money to invest in science, and welfare had nothing to do with the inherited fortune (from father and mother, who came from the enslaver family Bernon), based on Atlantic slavery? Was there an ideological heritage of the enslaver's activities of his father, a racist worldview?

merce with captives departing from Bordeaux, T. David/B. Etemad/J. M. Schaufenbuehl, *Schwarze Geschäfte. Die Beteiligung von Schweizern an Sklaverei und Sklavenhandel im 18. und 19. Jahrhundert*, Zürich 2005, pp. 27, 61.

37 Augeron, La mémoire, pp. 85–86. E. Chauveau, Une piqure de rappel sur la Traite. La Rochelle. L'association bordelaise Mémoires & Partages s'intéresse aux rues frappées des noms d'armateurs négriers, in: Sud-Ouest, 8.12.2017 (mentions that Mémoires & Partages visited La Rochelle in 2005, 2009, 2016 and 2017 to discuss the street names). Maxime Bono initiated the creation of memorial sites between 2008 and 2015, Augeron, La mémoire, pp. 87–94. Interview with Maxime Bono, 13.11.2019.

38 Facebook Memoria-La Rochelle, posted on 2 July 2020, an article about in the newspaper Sud-Ouest of the same day “Débaptiser les noms d'esclavagistes: les précisions de Memoria”.

39 L'histoire négrière au coin de la rue, in: La Rochelle.fr, <https://www.larochelle.fr/actualites/les-actualites/memoire-esclavage/lhistoire-negriere-au-coin-de-la-rue> (accessed 19.8.2021).

2.3. Nantes

Commemorative plaques at streets named after merchants in enslaved Africans do not exist in Nantes. Olivier Absolon from the *Direction du Patrimoine et de l'Archéologie* of Nantes asserted that the tablets of the *parcours urbain* following the traces of slavery would suffice. The problem of street names is explicated with the example of the *Rue de Kervégan* (*armateur-négrier* and Mayor of Nantes).⁴⁰ A renaming of streets would stigmatize certain families whereas all people in Nantes had profited from this trade. The website *Patrimonia* would include a virtual urban trail, with a first contribution to the street “Guillaume Grou, Armateur Nantais, Fondateur de l’Hospice des Orphelins, 1698–1774”.⁴¹ The complete urban trail with sept stopovers, designed by pupils of the 4th class of the *collège Chantenay* (a secondary school), was put online on 12 July 2021. It explains that the family Grou had financed 50 expeditions to deport African captives. The father of Guillaume had built a hotel on the Île Feydeau, Guillaume had donated 200.000 livres to the orphanage. The other stations refer to the street Kervégan, the streets named after abolitionists, the *Hôtel Montaudouin*, the residence of Mme Montaudouin de la Clartière, born in a family which practised the trade in enslaved Africans until the eve of the Revolution, and the *Quai des Antilles*, where in 2007 a temporary monument, the rings of memory, symbolizing chains had been installed.⁴²

The Antillean associations, particularly *Mémoire d’Outremer* had more concentrated on new sites of memory, the memorial, and street names. The “Passarelle Victor Schoelcher. Homme Politique Français. Défenseur de l’Abolition de l’esclavage. 1804–1893” is a pedestrian bridge, at the beginning of the Memorial, a visible site, whereas the “Rue Olympe de Gouges. 1748–1792. Déclaration des Droits de la Femme et de la Citoyenne”, is a little frequented side road at the *Palais de Justice* honouring her as female rights advocate, not as abolitionist.⁴³ The worst case of a pretend-to-remember place is the *Place Toussaint Louverture* at the town’s extreme periphery in front of the satellite city St. Herblain, in an ugly industrial area where nearly nobody lives and nobody passes by. That demonstrates a problem, if one renounces to re-baptize streets, with a preference for explaining them, the streets in the city centre will remain named after the old and new elite, the profiteers of slavery included. For new names, remembering abolitionists or once-enslaved revolutionaries is only space in new quarters or at the periphery.

In 2020, on the occasion of the murder of George Floyd, the Memorial of the Abolition of Slavery became once more the site of manifestations against racism and police violence.⁴⁴ Various interlocutors explained their attitude with reference to implicated

40 Christophe-Claire Danyel de Kervégan (1735–1817). Panneaux parcours dans la ville.

41 Interview with Olivier Absolon, 21.10.2019.

42 Nantes et le commerce triangulaire, in: *Patrimonia*, 12.7.2021. <https://patrimonia.nantes.fr/home/decouvrir/les-parcours-du-patrimoine/nantes-et-le-commerce-triangulaire.html> (accessed 19.8.2021).

43 U. Schmieder, Feminismus und Abolitionismus auf den Bühnen der revolutionären Frankreich: Olympe de Gouges (1783/88), in: C. Büschges/S. Rinke (eds.). *Das Ende des alten Kolonialsystems*, Wiesbaden 2019, pp. 176–181.

44 R. Goussanou, Quand l’hommage aux migrants africains se superpose à la commémoration des esclaves noirs.

streets in Nantes. Whereas *Mémoires & Partages* insists on the symbolic renaming of at least one street, *Mémoire d'Outremer* and *Anneaux de la Mémoire* remained with the idea “to explain, not to efface”, but not only the *Rue Kervégan*. Olivier Château, *adjoint au patrimoine de la ville*, emphasized that the plaque in the *Rue Kervégan* would be sufficient to interpret the problem with street names and enslavers in the public space.⁴⁵

2.4. Paris

Marcel Dorigny has studied the “question of street names after enslavers” in extenso.⁴⁶ The majority of street names in Paris related to colonialism refer to “heroes” of the second colonial Empire. The first colonial empire is for instance present with the *Rue Colbert* (see below), *Rue Duguay Trouin*, after the corsair René Duguay Trouin (1673–1736) from Saint-Malo who attacked Rio de Janeiro in 1711 and looted 600.000 cruzadas and 500 boxes of sugar, produced by enslaved Africans,⁴⁷ and *Rue Cambacérès* honoring Jean-Jacques Régis de Cambacérès, advocate of the third *Compagnie des Indes* 1796, lobbyist of Antillean enslavers, Second Consul 1799, who urged Napoleon Bonaparte to re-establish slavery.⁴⁸ A place, a street, and an underground station were baptized after the plantation Dugommier, owned by a French military, born in Guadeloupe, Jacques François Coquille, commander of the National Guard in Martinique. He was against the first abolition of slavery.⁴⁹ In the 18th Arrondissement is the *Quartier de l'Olive*, full of colonial nostalgia, with the *Rue de l'Olive* (Charles Liénard de L'Olive was the conqueror of Guadeloupe), *Rue de la Martinique*, *Rue de la Guadeloupe*, *Rue du Canada* and *Rue de la Louisiane*, named so in 1875.⁵⁰

One conflict shall be explained more in detail as it has a connection to the controversy about the historical legacy of Napoleon which occupied much attention in 2021. The *Rue de Richepance* between the 1st and 8th arrondissement had been named so in 1807, after the French General Antoine Richepance who was sent to Guadeloupe by Napoleon Bonaparte to disarm and deport the Republican free coloured officers and, if possible, to

Ethnographie du Mémorial de l'abolition de l'esclavage de Nantes, in: *L'Espace Politique*, 41 (2020) 2, <https://doi.org/10.4000/espacepolitique.8570>. In 2018 and 2019, protest against bad treatment of African migrants and slavery in Libya had been taken place here.

45 Nantes – Esclavagisme: pour les associations de mémoire, il ne faut pas rebaptiser les rues mais expliquer l'histoire, in: 3 Pays de la Loire, 11.6.2020, <https://france3-regions.francetvinfo.fr/pays-de-la-loire/loire-atlantique/nantes/esclavagisme-associations-memoire-il-ne-faut-pas-rebaptiser-rues-nantes-expliquer-histoire-1839970.html> (accessed 19.8.2021).

46 M. Dorigny, *Esclavage et première colonisation dans le paysage parisien d'aujourd'hui*, in: M. Dussauge, *Le Conseil départemental de la Guadeloupe* (ed.), *La route de l'esclave. Des itinéraires pour réconcilier histoire et mémoire*, Paris 2016, pp. 245–251. Interview with Marcel Dorigny, 8.5.2018.

47 D. Lailler, L. Le Cunff, *Saint-Malo. Cité corsaire*, Châteaulin 2010, pp. 4–5, 23.

48 E. Pruneaux, *Cambacérès (1753–1824)*, <http://www.cambaceres.fr/biograph/biograph.htm>, 16.3.2021, P. Branda/T. Lentz, *Napoléon, l'esclavage et les colonies*, Paris 2006, pp. 54–55, 83, 104, 121.

49 Interview with Marcel Dorigny, 8.5.2018. Palais de la Porte Dorée, *Traces de l'Histoire coloniale dans le 12e Arrondissement de Paris*, p. 16.

50 M. Dorigny, *A Paris, il faudrait redonner du sens plutôt qu'effacer les noms*, in: *Libération*, 22.8.2017. https://www.liberation.fr/france/2017/08/22/marcel-dorigny-a-paris-il-faudrait-redonner-du-sens-plutot-qu-effacer-les-noms_1591370/ (accessed 27.8.2021).

re-establish slavery. He repressed the resistance of Guadeloupeans under Louis Delgrès, and Ignace. Richepance sent the freedmen back to the fields on 28 May 1801, nullified the citizenship of Persons of colours, cancelled salaries and re-established the authority of masters over their rural workers with a decree of 17 July 1801. Richepance died of yellow fever on 3 September 1802, before the process of re-establishment of slavery was legally fully completed, but in July and August 1802 the re-enslaved were sold and bought again.⁵¹ Since the 1990ies (on occasion of the bicentenary of the first abolition in 1994, and the 150 anniversary of the abolition 1998) protests against the street name had taken place, but the conservative Mayor of Paris from 1995–2001, Jean Tiberi, rejected this proposal. The street was renamed under the socialist Mayor from 2001–2014, Bertrand Delanoë, in 2002. The idea to re-baptize the street *Rue de la mulâtresse Solitude*, coming from Georges Pau-Langevin, *Conseillère déléguée du Maire de Paris pour Outre-Mer*, failed because of the resistance of the initiative of local merchants „Oui à la rue Richepance“. The compromise was *Rue du Chevalier de Saint-George*,⁵² after the violinist and composer from Guadeloupe, Joseph de Bologne, son of the enslaved woman Nanon and her proprietor Georges de Bologne. Until today a hotel in this street keeps the name *Hôtel Opera-Richepanse*.⁵³

In 2020, in the context of the Black Lives Matter movement, Parisian debates focused on monuments and historical sites connected to the slavery past, including the revelation that the Palais de l'Élysée, the Palace of the President, had been built by enslaver Antoine Crozat for his son-in-law, the Count d'Évreux, as part of the dowry of his daughter.⁵⁴ Street names were seldom mentioned in the controversies, surely also because of a lack of knowledge about the historical personalities above mentioned, with exception of the *Rue Colbert*, *Place Colbert* and *Galerie Colbert*, part of the struggle about all sites of memory for this French Minister.

51 J.-F. Niori, J. Richard, A propos de la découverte de l'arrêté consulaire du 16 juillet 1802 et du rétablissement de l'ancien ordre colonial (spécialement de l'esclavage) à la Guadeloupe, in: Bulletin de la Société d'Histoire de la Guadeloupe, 152 (2009). F. Eichmann, Krieg und Revolution in der Karibik: Die Kleinen Antillen 1789–1815, Berlin 2019, pp. 315–348. Delgrès and his allies fought, above all, for equal rights of free people of colour, particularly in the army. Only a small number of "freed" rural labourers could be recruited, as the "revolutionary army" had held them in a harsh system of forced labour on the fields which differed little from slavery.

52 "Rue du Chevalier de Saint-George (Ancienne Rue Richepanse) Joseph de Bologne (1745–1799). Musicien et chef d'Orchestre. Capitaine de la Garde Nationale de Lille. Colonel de la Légion des Américains et du Midi". B. Gainot, Joseph de Bologne, chevalier de Saint-George, in: E. Noël (ed.), Dictionnaire des gens de couleur dans la France Moderne, Geneva 2011, pp. 34–36, indicates as life span 1746–1799.

53 M. Dorigny, De la rue Richepanse à la rue du Chevalier Saint-George en passant par la rue Delgrès, in: Paris colonial (unpublished manuscript, thanks to M. Dorigny). Dorigny, Esclavage et première colonisation, pp. 247–250.

54 B. Grossien, L'Élysée, le plus grand symbole à Paris du passé esclavagiste de la France, in: France Culture, 2.8.2020 (interviewed M. Dorigny, <https://www.franceculture.fr/histoire/elysee-le-plus-grand-symbole-a-paris-du-passe-esclavagiste-de-la-france> (accessed 19.8.2021). About Crozat, founder of companies trading enslaved Africans: P. Ménard, Le Français qui possédait l'Amérique. La vie extraordinaire d'Antoine Crozat, milliardaire sous Louis XIV, Paris 2019.

3. "Vandalizing" Monuments in 2020

Immediately before the murder of George Floyd and the following wave of the Black Lives Matter Movement, hexagonal France had been confronted with the statue toppling in Martinique, the destruction of two statues of abolitionist Victor Schoelcher, a controversial issue on the island (see the contribution about Martinique and Cuba in this volume). The hasty, nearly unanimous condemnation of these acts of "vandalism" showed the complete indifference of the French state and society towards the socio-economic problems and cultures of memory on the Antillean Island. President Macron tweeted, "When he abolished slavery 172 years ago, Victor Schœlcher has done the grandeur of France. I condemn with decidedness the acts perpetrated yesterday in Martinique, which soil his memory and that of the Republic." This colonial discourse negates Martinican self-liberation on 22 May 1848 and the engagement of Afro-descendant abolitionists. Antilleans are not so much interested in the grandeur of France which maintained slavery for more than 200 years only to replace it by a racialized colonial forced labour system.⁵⁵ The Overseas Minister Annick Girardin said about the questioning of history: "In no case this must be done through the destruction of monuments which incarnate our collective memory."⁵⁶ What does "our collective memory" mean? Can there be a common memory of the descendants of enslavers and descendants of the enslaved, privileged whites and discriminated Persons of Colour?

In mainland France, Black Lives Matter Manifestations took place in various towns, Paris, Lille, Bordeaux, Lyon, Marseille, Nantes, on 6 and 9 June 2020 protesting against police violence, not only in the United States, but also in France, remembering Adama Traoré and Cédric Chaumont who died during their detention put in ventral position as George Floyd.⁵⁷

Jean-Marc Ayrault tried to initiate a debate about Jean-Baptiste Colbert's role in slavery history, asked for a removal of his statue in front of the Assemblée Nationale and proposed to rename the meeting room "Jean-Baptiste Colbert" in the building of the National Assembly.⁵⁸ Macron responded:

55 N. Schmidt, *La France a-t-elle aboli l'esclavage? Guadeloupe – Martinique – Guyane (1830–1935)*, Paris 2009. U. Schmieder, *Martinique and Cuba Grande: Commonalities and Differences during the Periods of Slavery, Abolition and Post-Emancipation*, in: *Review, Journal of the Fernand Braudel Center* XXXVI (2013) 1, pp. 83–112.

56 *Le Monde* avec AFP, *Deux statues de Victor Schoelcher brisées par des manifestants en Martinique*, in: *Le Monde*, 23.5.2020, https://www.lemonde.fr/societe/article/2020/05/23/deux-statues-de-victor-schoelcher-brisees-par-des-manifestants-en-martinique_6040559_3224.html (accessed 27.8.2020).

57 *Violences policières: plus de 23 000 manifestants mobilisés en France, selon l'Intérieur*, in: *Le Parisien*, 6.6.2020, <https://www.leparisien.fr/faits-divers/violences-policieres-les-manifestants-mobilises-malgre-les-interdictions-06-06-2020-8331009.php>. Goussanou, *Quand l'hommage*, p. 22. About Traoré and Chaumont: Commission nationale consultative des droits de l'homme (CNCDH), *La lutte contre le racisme, l'antisémitisme et la xénophobie*, année 2020, p. 315, <https://www.cncdh.fr/fr/publications/rapport-2020-sur-la-lutte-contre-le-racisme-l-antisemitisme-et-la-xenophobie> (accessed 20.8.2021). The CNCDH is an institution of the French Government composed by (white) members of human right associations.

58 "Comment comprendre que dans les locaux de l'Assemblée nationale, une salle porte encore le nom de Colbert?", in: *Le Monde*, 13.6.2020. <https://headtopics.com/fr/comment-comprendre-que-dans-les-locaux-de-l-assemblee-nationale-une-salle-porte-encore-le-nom-de-13647430> (accessed 20.8.2021).

The Republic will not efface any trace, any name of its history. [...] The Republic will not oust statues. We must rather look together clear-thinking at our whole history, all our memories.

Thus, the Republic honours a historical personality which is closely connected with the government of absolutist monarchs, which the First French Republic brought to fall.⁵⁹ Some day after the verbal exchange between Ayrault and Macron, the monument of Jean-Baptiste Colbert in front of the National Assembly in Paris was painted in red with the words: “NEGROPHOBIE D’ETAT”, by Franco Lollia from Guadeloupe, 48 years old, member of the *Brigade Anti-Negrophobie*,⁶⁰ on 23 June 2020.⁶¹ Jean-Baptiste Colbert (1619–1683), Minister (of Finances and the Marine) of King Louis XIV (1643/1661–1715) was associated by the author of the tagging and antiracist activists with the *Code Noir*, the corpus of laws about slavery promulgated by Louis XIV after Colbert’s death. These laws defined the enslaved as commodity, equalized “esclaves” with “Noirs” and stipulated cruel death punishments for resistance. Colbert compiled the already existing regulations in the colonies for this juridical Code, reflecting the spirit and the interests of the planters/enslavers.⁶² Surprisingly, in these debates his role as promotor of French colonialism, founder and shareholder (with the King, the highest noblemen, convents, and bishops) of the *Compagnie des Indes Occidentales* (new owner of the Caribbean islands) and the *Compagnie des Indes Orientales* both trading enslaved people, was seldom mentioned. After the dissolution of *Compagnie des Indes Occidentales* in 1674 and the introduction of direct rule of the Monarch over the colonies, Colbert initiated the foundation of the *Compagnies du Sénégal* for the commerce with African captives.⁶³ Nobody expected that the President of the Republic would say, “Wonderful, let’s smash all statues”, but instead of condemning only Macron could have used the occasion to open a debate. What democracy and civic education do mean in a multicultural society where the descendants of enslavers, and descendants of the enslaved (and discriminated freedmen of colour who owned enslaved themselves) live together in one state? They share a history and its legacies, but their ancestors and they themselves experienced this history in very different ways. Could and should that lead to another public history, to differentiated memorial cityscapes? What the President rejected to discuss, was debated in the media. The FME organized an online roundtable with historians and philosophers

59 La France “ne déboulonnera pas de statues”, a assuré Emmanuel Macron, in: L’OBS, 14.6.2020, <https://www.nouvelobs.com/politique/20200614.OBS30060/la-france-ne-deboulonnera-pas-de-statues-a-assure-emmanuel-macron.html> (accessed 20.8.2021).

60 BRIGADE / COLLECTIF ANTI NEGROPHOBIE, <http://amon-france.com/> (accessed 27.8.2021).

61 La statue de Colbert vandalisée devant l’Assemblée nationale, in: Le Monde, 25.6.2020, https://www.lemonde.fr/societe/article/2020/06/24/la-statue-de-colbert-vandalisee-devant-l-assemblee-nationale_6043986_3224.html (accessed 20.8.2021). M.A. Marchal, VIDÉO. La statue de Colbert vandalisée devant l’Assemblée Nationale à Paris, in: ActuParis, 24.6.2020. Quotes the author: “Look, the racists are on the other side of the assembly. That is a statue which supports the hatred against blacks, the death of blacks, the violation of blacks, the torture of Blacks.”

62 L. Sala Molins, *Le Code Noir ou le calvaire de Canaan*, Paris 12007.

63 T. Diakité, *Louis XIV et l’Afrique Noire*, Paris 2013, pp. 18–19, 33–37. P. P. Boucher, *France and the American Tropics to 1700, Tropics of Discontent?* Baltimore 2008, pp. xiii, 172–178, 188, 202–228.

(Jean-François Niort, Sea Peabody, Syliane Larcher, Achille Mbembe) about the *Code Noir* and its legacy, correcting common errors, emphasizing that Colbert did not improve or aggravate the situation of the enslaved, but promulgated the rules in the name of the absolutist King.⁶⁴ His role in the trafficking companies was not focussed. It was asked why Colbert was targeted, but not King Louis XIV who promulgated the laws, or Napoleon Bonaparte who reintroduced the already abolished slavery in 1802.⁶⁵

In 2021, Franco Lollia was condemned to pay a fine of 500 € and to transfer 1040 € to the National Assembly. He appealed the judgement claiming that his act was a political statement, not a damage of property. Franco Lollia and his advocate want to achieve also that the statue will be removed and pursue the authorities for apologizing a crime against humanity.⁶⁶

Other tagged statues honour colonizers of the second colonial Empire, as General Faidherbe, the Governor of Senegal, in Lille, General Bugeaud, representing ruthless colonial warfare in Algeria in 1845, Jules Ferry, theorist of colonial expansion, and Marshal Gallieni, commander in different colonial wars, author of a massacre in Madagascar, in Paris.⁶⁷ In 2020, only one of hundreds of statues and monuments for Emperor Napoleon was painted red, in La Roche-sur-Yon.⁶⁸ That is remarkable because Colbert acted in a time when critique on the enslaving practices of European colonialism was seldom outspoken, whereas Napoleon Bonaparte re-established slavery after enlightened thinkers had condemned slavery, and the Convent had abolished the “crime de lèse-humanité”.⁶⁹ Those who were not informed about Napoleon’s role in the Antillean colonies might become aware of it in 2021, on occasion of the bicentenary of his death.

4. The Conflict about a National Hero with Many Sites of Memory in France: Napoleon Bonaparte

Napoleon Bonaparte became Emperor after having re-established slavery and made racial segregation worse than under the Ancien régime in 1802⁷⁰ except Saint-Domingue/

64 J.-F. Niort/J. Richard, L’Édit royal de mars 1685 touchant la police des îles de l’Amérique française dit “Code Noir”: Comparaison des éditions anciennes à partir de la version “Guadeloupe”, in: Bulletin de la Société d’Histoire de la Guadeloupe, 156 (2010), pp. 73–89.

65 <https://www.facebook.com/fondationpourlamemoiredelesclavage/videos/live-colbert-le-code-et-apr%C3%A8s-3-juillet-2020/313297486356034/> (accessed 27.8.2021).

66 J. Péru-Gelly, Franco Lollia, porte-parole de la Brigade Anti-négrophobie, a écopé d’une amende de 500 euros, pour avoir tagué en juin 2020, la statue de Colbert devant l’Assemblée nationale, in: <https://la1ere.francetvinfo.fr/statue-de-colbert-taguée-a-l-assemblée-nationale-condamné-a-une-amende-de-500-euros-le-militant-fait-appel-1046659.html> (accessed 20.8.2021).

67 Les statues de la discorde, in: L’Obs, 12.6.2020, <https://www.nouvelobs.com/societe/20200612.AFP7615/les-statues-de-la-discorde.html> (accessed 23.8.2021).

68 N. Pipelier, La Roche-sur-Yon: la statue de Napoléon vandalisée, nettoyée “avant la fin de l’été”, in: Le Journal du Pays Yonnais, 28.7.2020.

69 M. Dorigny, Les abolitions de l’esclavage, Paris 2018, pp. 20–34, 48–59.

70 The re-establishment of slavery by Napoleon Bonaparte was a complicated process of which one does not only find false information in the media, but also in the academic historiography. The FME resumed the most

Haiti where his army was defeated in the battle of Vertières, a historical event long ignored in Western historiography. His Generals Leclerc (his brother-in-law), and Rochambeau waged a genocidal war against the people of Saint-Domingue with the idea that new Africans should replace the freedmen “spoiled by liberty”. Black soldiers, black rural workers and their families were shot, hanged, burnt alive, crucified, tortured to death, drowned in the sea, and asphyxiated by sulphur dioxide in the bilges. Rochambeau’s introduction of giant dogs from Cuba with the idea to let them hunt and bite to death black refugees did not succeed because the dogs bit everybody, but this act tells something about the mind of French Generals vis-à-vis black people, and is deeply rooted in Haitian collective memory.⁷¹

President Macron and the First Lady laid on 5 May 2021 a wreath at the tomb of Bonaparte in the *Église du Dôme des Invalides*, a giant site of memory for the Emperor in the space of the Invalides, where also the Museum of the Army has its seat which glorifies all French wars and its commanders indistinctively if wars were led in self-defence, or as part of colonial conquest or colonial repression.⁷²

Later Macron delivered a speech in the Institut de France “Napoleon is a part of us” in front of members of the academic community and pupils of the Lycées. It was a long eulogy to the warrior, strategist, lawmaker, builder, responsible for the progressive Civil and Penal Code, founder of the grandes écoles, lycées, the University in its modern form, in spite of all controversies about him a man of freedom, according to Macron. The re-establishment of slavery was mentioned and marked as treason of the ideas of Enlightenment, repaired by the Second Republic, but Macron stated, that one should not give in to those who would efface his oeuvre because it does not correspond to their

important data and reproduced the ordinances in: Les notes de la FME 2 (2021): 20 May 1802: decree-law by First Consul Napoleon Bonaparte (authorizing slave trade and slavery where it was not abolished, because of British occupation, p.e.in Martinique). 17 July 1802: Ordinance of General Richepance in Guadeloupe (see above). 16 July 1802: Ordinance by Consul Napoleon Bonaparte (re-establishing slavery in Guadeloupe). 7 December 1802: ordinance of Bonaparte (binding workers to properties and declaring Africans arrived in Guyana after 14 June 1794 slaves). 29 May 1803: order of Captain General in Guyana Victor Hughes (all workers and new slaves could be sold from 20 June 1804 on). 8 January 1801: Circular (forbidding marriages between whites and blacks). 29 May 1802: ordinance (expulsing soldiers and officers of colour from Paris). 25 June 1802: prohibition of the entrance of Blacks and “métisses” to the Metropolitan territory except special authorization.

71 J. P. Le Glaunec, *L’armée indigène. La défaite de Napoléon en Haïti*, Montréal 2020, pp. 89–125. J. P. Glaunec, *The Cry of Vertières. Liberation, Memory, and the Beginning of Haiti*, Montréal 2020. R. Bélénus, *Saint-Domingue et Guadeloupe en 1802*, in: S. Dracius et al. (ed.), *La faute à Bonaparte*, Paris éditions 2021, pp. 26–69. M. Dorigny, *Le rétablissement de l’esclavage sous le Consulat: Une décision improvisée ou le fruit d’un projet préparé?*, in: *ibid.*, pp. 71–92. P. R. Girard, *French Atrocities during the Haitian War of Independence*, in: *Journal of Genocide Research*, 15 (2013) 2, pp. 133–149. B. Gainot, “Sur fond de cruelle inhumanité”: les politiques du massacre dans la Révolution de Haïti, in: *Cahiers de l’Institut d’Histoire de la Révolution Française*, (2011) 3, <http://lrf.revues.org/index180.html>. Only Le Glaunec speaks, on the basis of a close reading of the correspondence of French militaries in Saint-Domingue with Paris, of “genocidal violence” and “genocidal desire” (pp. 101, 124), presumably because his position as outsider teaching at the University of Sherbrooke in Canada allows him to do so. French historians speak of “massacres”, “cruelties”, “atrocities”, etc.

72 Emmanuel et Brigitte Macron devant le tombeau de Napoléon pour le bicentenaire de sa mort, in: *Paris Match*, 5.5.2021, <https://www.parismatch.com/Actu/Politique/Emmanuel-et-Brigitte-Macron-devant-le-tombeau-de-Napoleon-pour-le-bicentenaire-de-sa-mort-1736774> (accessed 23.8.2021). Museum visited by author 19.5.2018.

ideas of today.⁷³ Macron ignored thus that even after the execution of so many revolutionaries during the era of revolutionary and counter-revolutionary terror there were still men in 1802 who voted against the maintenance of slavery of the law of 20 May 1802.⁷⁴ Was their opposition an anachronism, or the re-enslavement of the freedmen? More important was what the President did not mention: the exclusion of the colonies from the constitutional rule, the wars of annihilation against Haitians and Guadeloupeans, the deportation and murder of militaries of Colour by the white brothers in arms, the profound racism of Bonaparte.

Five days after his speech glorifying Napoleon Bonaparte President Macron participated at the small commemorative ceremony on the National Day of Remembrance of the Slave Trade, Slavery and its Abolitions in the Jardin du Luxembourg, laid a wreath and said – nothing. The silence of the President on the 20th anniversary of the Law Taubira appalled Christiane Taubira so much (who was present because the TV filmed the ceremony and made the interviews on site) that she left the Park after a harsh commentary. The other participants of the roundtable discussion (historians François Durpaire, Myriam Cottias, journalist and singer Marijosé Alie and Emmanuel Gordien from the CM98) were shocked and protested vigorously.⁷⁵ The speech honouring Napoleon Bonaparte and the silence for the enslaved sent a clear message to citizens of Antillean and African descent: Black lives did not matter, black lives do not matter, end of debate.

Myriam Cottias, who has co-initiated the critical commemoration of slavery and closely followed the related controversies since 1997 suggested that Macrons speech and Macrons silence were part of an effort to gain votes (for the regional elections in June 2021) from the right who rejects firmly the “repentance” about slavery and colonialism and clings to a glorifying national history of great men.⁷⁶ This evaluation is surely right. Looking back to Macrons relation to the 10 May and Black France, one observes that he has given only one speech during this Presidency on this commemorative day 10 May, in 2019, when he announced once more the inauguration of the Foundation of Memory and promised financial support.⁷⁷ For a short historical moment, it seemed that

73 “Napoléon Bonaparte est une part de nous”: Emmanuel Macron célèbre le bicentenaire de la mort d’une figure controversée, in: *Le Monde*, 5 May 2021, https://www.lemonde.fr/politique/article/2021/05/05/emmanuel-macron-celebrent-les-200-ans-de-la-mort-de-napoleon-figure-toujours-contestee_6079228_823448.html (accessed 9.5.2021).

74 The decree of 20 May 1802 was adopted with 54 votes in favour and 27 against in the *Tribunat*, and 211 in favour and 63 against in the *Corps Législatif* (Les notes de la FME, 2 (2021)).

75 See: 10 mai: revivez la cérémonie de commémoration de l’abolition de l’esclavage, in: Franceinfo1, le portail des Outre-mer, 10.5.2021. <https://la1ere.francetvinfo.fr/direct-comment-suivre-la-ceremonie-du-10-mai-1004971.html> (accessed 25.5.2021).

76 Conversation with Myriam Cottias on 27 May 2021 par zoom. The strategy of Macron did not function, his party LREM and the extreme right (*Rassemblement National*, RN) have lost votes, the alliance of conservative parties and moderate left alliance led by the Parti Socialiste (PS) gained votes won in the Hexagon, but two thirds of voters abstained. <https://www.lemonde.fr/resultats-elections/> (accessed 26.8.2021).

77 He participated as designated President at the celebration in 10 May 2017 with President Hollande. In 2018, he was on 10 May in Aix-la-Chapelle to get the “Karlspreis”, an award for the unity of Europe. He had delivered a speech at an anticipated ceremony in 2018 on 27 April in the Pantheon. The problem for Antillean in that year was not so much what he said, but that the commemoration took place on 27 April associated with the cult of

he would approach Antilleans as his predecessor Hollande had done, offering at least symbolic reparation for enslavement. But in 2020, things changed. In February 2020, Frédérique Vidal, his Minister of Higher Education, Research and Innovation, ordered the National Centre for Scientific Research to realize a study about “islamo-gauchisme” and postcolonial studies at French Universities, using the enemy image of the extreme right, painting Universities as palladium of leftist supporters of islamism (confounding the critique on islamophobia with adherence to terrorism) and critics of the colonial past who would endanger national unity.⁷⁸ On 10 May 2020, Macron was absent during the six minutes lasting ceremony to commemorate slavery and abolition in the Jardin du Luxembourg, publishing a short tweet demanding to remember the heroes of the fight against slavery. In June 2020, his only reaction to the debate about and tagging of monuments had been rejection and repression, explicitly expressing his solidarity with the police and denying systemic racist violence against black people.⁷⁹ He refused thus any debate about a new narrative of national history including the memories of once-colonized and enslaved, and a reform of memorial cityscapes abstaining from glorifying enslavers. How many French white people share his opinions? A significant number of young white people participated in the Black Lives Matter manifestations. Doing participant observation at the events and manifestations of Antillean associations one meets many white members and sympathizers.⁸⁰ Various memorial associations which remember slavery in de-colonial and anti-racist way have black and white members.⁸¹ The National Consultative Commission on Human Rights found out in March 2021 that 32,9 % of 2000 interviewed persons thought that in France one would speak in France “not enough” about the slave trade and the slavery of Blacks, 25,5 % meant that one would speak “too much”, and 41,6 % that the level about talking about topic would be the necessary one. In 2019, the percentages had been 38 % (“not enough”), 19 % (“too much”), 43 % (“the necessary”).⁸² Did the President followed people’s change of

white abolitionist Schoelcher, and that, with a very reduced number of invited guests, it was an even more elitist event than the ceremonies in the Jardin du Luxembourg accessible only by invitation by name.

78 Commission nationale, *La lutte*, p. 274. The protest of the University Presidents and staff: “Islamo-gauchisme”: “Nous, universitaires et chercheurs, demandons avec force la démission de Frédérique Vidal”. Plus de 600 membres du personnel de l’enseignement supérieur et de la recherche, dont l’économiste Thomas Piketty et la sociologue Dominique Méda, dénoncent, dans une tribune au “Monde”, la “chasse aux sorcières” menée selon eux par leur ministre de tutelle, in: *Le Monde*, 20.2.2020, https://www.lemonde.fr/idees/article/2021/02/20/islamo-gauchisme-nous-universitaires-et-chercheurs-demandons-avec-force-la-demission-de-frederique-vidal_6070663_3232.html.

79 La France “ne déboulonnera pas de statues”. Commission nationale, *La lutte*, p. 316–317. 50 % of men considered arab or black experimented identity controls by the police, 80 % of the men considered arab or black under 25 (vs. 16 % in the general population), the probability of control was 20 times higher. 20 % of persons racialized as black have been physically mistreated, 21 % verbally insulted, 40 % called “tu” instead of “vous”. In 94 % of the identity controls did not lead to juridical persecution, that means there were no offenses justifying the control.

80 Own observations in May/June 2018 in Paris and October/ November 2019 in Nantes and La Rochelle.

81 Pe. Anneaux de la Mémoire and Mémoire d’Outremer in Nantes, *Mémoires & Partages* in the port towns, CIFER-DOM (Centre d’Information, Formation, Recherche et Développement pour les Originaires d’Outre-Mer).

82 Commission nationale, *La lutte*, p. 404. Answer to Q 19 “En France aujourd’hui, vous avez le sentiment que l’on parle trop, pas assez ou ce qu’il faut des traites négrières et de l’esclavage des Noirs”. Status of 2019, p. 91,

opinion or did he change them? The commission noticed an augmentation of xenophobic acts and expressions during the pandemic, and a decline of diversity in the media. In autumn 2020 many protests took place against the law about “sécurité globale préservant les libertés”, proposed by Macron’s party *La République en Marche*, which prohibited to diffuse images or videos of policemen in action in article 24. Extreme police violence against black music producer Michel Zecler (whose offense was not to wear a mask on the street) demonstrated the problem of this rule and that racialized people would suffer particularly. The cruel beating of Michel Zecler was filmed by neighbours what spared him jail, as the policemen accused him falsely of rebellion. Macron was forced to condemn this brutality.⁸³ The law was adopted in 15 April 2021 with a reformed paragraph, but various articles have been declared to be not conform to the Constitution.⁸⁴ Against this background, law and order politics and restraining academic liberties Macron had lost all confidence at the left and tried to gain for votes at the right with a nationalist, white supremacist identity discourse in May 2021 on occasion of the bicentenary of Bonaparte’s death. He could only remain silent on the ceremony commemorating the abolition of slavery on 10 May, otherwise he had contradicted to his own speech five days earlier.

Whereas the President rejected to discuss a de-colonial narrative of the story of the French nation, some historians did not so. Experts in French policy towards slavery and the Caribbean around 1800 participated at three roundtable debates about “Bonaparte and Slavery” on 8 May 2021, organized by the “Opérateurs de la Mémoire”, eight memorial associations.⁸⁵ Marcel Dorigny, Marion Godfroy, Bruno Maillard, Frédéric Regent, Jean-François Niort, Éric Saugera discussed the re-establishment of the trade in enslaved Africans and Slavery, Carolyn Finck, Bernard Gainot, Philippe Girard, Philippe Pichot, Enance Saint-Fleur about Toussaint Louverture, Napoleon Bonaparte and Saint-Domingue/Haiti, Cécilia Elimort, Joseph de la Hausse de Lalouvière, Sue Peabody, Eric Saunier, Pierre Serna, Lionel Trani and Erick Noël about slavery and segregation under Napoleon Bonaparte. New books of these historians were presented and many documents shown on screen which proved the pro-slavery and pro-segregation politics of the First Consul. The historians did not express a monolithic view, their opinions differ, for

numbers given for 2021 differ slightly from those indicated on p. 404. About the effects of the pandemic pp. 224–226, 360.

83 Commission nationale, *La lutte*, p. 315. *Le Monde* with AFP, Aggression de Michel Zecler: Emmanuel Macron dénonce des images qui “nous font honte” et demande “une police exemplaire”, in : *Le Monde*, 27.11.2020, https://www.lemonde.fr/societe/article/2020/11/27/emmanuel-macron-tres-choque-le-monde-politique-en-emoi-apres-la-revelation-de-nouvelles-violences-policieres_6061357_3224.html (accessed 26.8.2021).

84 All versions and the decision of the Conseil constitutionnel: Loi n° 2021-646 du 25 mai 2021 pour une sécurité globale préservant les libertés, <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/dossierlegislatif/JORFDOLE000042563668/> (accessed 27.8.2021).

85 Anneaux de la Mémoire, APECE (Association Pour l’Étude de la Colonisation Européenne), CIFORDOM, CM98, Coque Nomade Fraternité, Mémoires & Partages, PROTEA (Les Revoltés de l’Histoire), Route des abolitions and Routes du Philanthrope.

instance about the degree of responsibility of Bonaparte for the massacres in Guadeloupe and Haiti.⁸⁶

When this media event was an example of a civilized conversation, including controversies between historians, and historians and activists, not all media presentations about “Bonaparte and the slavery question” fell in this category. As an example may serve a radio interview with Thierry Lentz, author of various monographs about Napoleon Bonaparte and President of the *Fondation Napoléon*,⁸⁷ and memorial activist Louis-Georges Tin⁸⁸ under the title “Napoleon on trial”⁸⁹, led by philosopher Alain Finkielkraut. Tin, lecturer of French literature at the Université d’Orléans, argued in a hostile atmosphere with admirable tranquillity for recognition, reparation, and reconciliation, towards the enslavement past, showing to be well informed not only about French colonial history, but also about international politics of memory and restitution. He opposed the wreath ceremony at Bonaparte’s tomb which had be an honouring celebration and not a differentiated remembrance and evaluation of complex historical personality. Lentz enacted himself as neutral, objective, all knowing historian, who represents the true values of France and who alone is authorised to interpret French history. Immigrants and activists would criticize French heroes because of ideological reasons and endanger national unity and peaceful conviviality, they should better remain silent.⁹⁰ A deconstruction of the arguments of Lentz in the defence of Bonaparte would make necessary to write another article,⁹¹ but as this is a contribution about the legacies of slavery, it is necessary to notice the final remark of the radio-emission. Alain Finkielkraut accused Tin to be ungrateful for his education at the École normale supérieure, a Napoleonic institution, for his studies in France, and for what France gave him. France would donate chances, a language, culture, landscapes, and also social insurance and free schooling. In this discourse only white people belong to the French nation and have natural rights to its achievements. Persons of Colour are all immigrants (and thus also the French citizen born in Martinique, Louis-Georges Tin) and must be grateful for the conceded rights. This narrative ignores how much of the French cultural heritage was achieved on the backs of enslaved

86 Table ronde: Napoléon, le rétablissement de la traite négrière et de l’esclavage, à revoir ICI, <https://la1ere.francetvinfo.fr/direct-table-ronde-napoleon-le-retablissement-de-la-traite-negriere-et-de-l-esclavage-a-suivre-ici-1002694.html> (part I) <https://www.facebook.com/operateursdememoire/videos/570445123936822> (part II and III) (accessed 25.8.2021).

87 T. Lentz, *Pour Napoléon*, Paris 2021. T. Lentz, *Napoléon*, dictionnaire historique, Paris 2020. Branda/Lentz, *Napoléon, l’esclavage*.

88 L.-G. Tin, *Esclavage et réparation: Comment faire face aux crimes de l’histoire*, Paris 2013.

89 *Napoleon en procès*, in: Radio France culture, 29.5.2021, <https://www.franceculture.fr/emissions/repliques/napoleon-en-proces> (accessed 25.8.2021).

90 Four of 19 invited historians and the three moderators of the mentioned roundtable were not white persons what reflects, of course, also a problem, that the underrepresentation of POC in the academia, but demonstrates that the critique on Bonaparte’s actions in the Caribbean does not come exclusively from Antilleans and Africans as Lentz suggested.

91 To be informed rapidly re-hear the roundtable debate, to follow the controversy see historiography indicated in note 71 versus Branda/Lentz, *Napoléon, l’esclavage*.

Africans,⁹² and overlooks what Antilleans contribute to these French attainments with their work in the hospitals and schools, at the post and public transport. The literary scientist Tin argued not so profanely like me, but with a quotation from Sartres “Orphée noir” (1948), the preface to Leopold Sédar Senghors “Anthologie de la nouvelle poésie nègre et malgache de langue française” ridiculing the idea that black people would admire their liberators who had before their enslavers.

5. Conclusion

The years 2020 and 2021 have been a new acme in what French historians have qualified as “wars of memory”.⁹³ The conflicts over the politics of memory of slavery, the cultural heritage of slavery, old and new memorial sites seems to be abysmal, albeit in Paris and surroundings the clashes go deeper than in smaller towns. Especially the conflicts around Colbert and Napoleon show, that many white people retrocede when they learn, that a critical remembrance of slavery means more than a moral condemnation of slavery and celebrations of its abolition, but one has to re-write national history completely, throwing over board important figures of national proud and illusions about the national grandeur. However, this is not a dispute between white and racialized persons. A part of the white civil society wants to de-colonize its worldview and material surroundings and to overcome racism, although there is a long way from intending not to be racist and approaching this aim in a society permeated by racism and persisting white privilege. It might be that in the United Kingdom, the Netherlands, and Belgium, the conflicts are as deep as in France, but those who fought for a de-colonial reform of the memorial cityscapes have achieved more, at least some monuments were brought to the museums, and some streets, buildings, and institutions have been renamed. In France, it seems easier to establish new sites of memory than to remove or comment overdue symbols of white supremacy in the public space.

92 In France, the anti-Eric-Williams-fraction in the debate about slavery as source for capitalist development had dominated for a long time. Recently this has changed (C. Le Mao, *L'argent de la traite et de l'esclavage*, in: Le Mao, Bordeaux, La Rochelle, pp. 93–116). This corresponds to international research trends (Combrink/van Rossum, *Europe and Slavery*. M. Zeuske/S. Conermann (eds.), *The Slavery/Capitalism Debate Global: From “Capitalism and Slavery” to Slavery as Capitalism*, *Comparativ, Zeitschrift für Globalgeschichte und vergleichende Gesellschaftsforschung*, 30 (2020) 5/6.

93 F. Vergès, *Esclavage colonial: Quelles mémoires? Quels héritages?*, in: P. Blanchard/I. Veyrat-Masson (eds.), *Les guerres de mémoires: enjeux politiques, controverses historiques, stratégies médiatiques*, Paris 2008, pp. 155–164.